

1 THE HONORABLE BARBARA J. ROTHSTEIN
2
3
4

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

WADE K. MARLER, DDS, *et al.*,

NO. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR

Plaintiffs,

v.

ASPEN AMERICAN INSURANCE
COMPANY,

Defendant.

KARA MCCULLOCH DMD MSD PLLC, *et
al.*,

NO. 2:20-cv-00809-BJR

Plaintiffs,

v.

VALLEY FORGE INSURANCE
COMPANY, *et al.*,

Defendants.

CABALLERO,

NO. 2: 20-cv-05437-BJR

Plaintiff,

v.

MASSACHUSETTS BAY INSURANCE
COMPANY,

Defendant.

STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS
CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-
BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR;
2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 1

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200
Seattle, WA 98101-3052
TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900
FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

1 CHORAK, *et al.*,

2 NO. 2:20-CV-00627-BJR

3 Plaintiffs,

4 v.

5 HARTFORD CASUALTY INSURANCE
COMPANY, *et al.*,

6 Defendants.

7
8 PACIFIC ENDODONTICS, P.C., *et al.*,

9 NO. 2:20-CV-00620-BJR

10 Plaintiffs,

11 v.

12 OHIO CASUALTY INSURANCE
COMPANY, *et al.*,

13 Defendants.

14
15 NGUYEN, *et al.*,

16 NO. 2:20-cv-00597-BJR

17 Plaintiffs,

18 v.

19 TRAVELERS CASUALTY INSURANCE
COMPANY OF AMERICA, *et al.*,

20 Defendants.

21
22
23
24
25
26 STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS
CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-
BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR;
2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 2

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200
Seattle, WA 98101-3052
TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900
FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

1 LA COCINA DE OAXACA LLC,

2 Plaintiff,

3 v.

4 TRI-STATE INSURANCE COMPANY OF
5 MINNESOTA,

6 Defendant.

NO. 2:20-CV-01176-BJR

8 MARK GERMACK DDS,

9 Plaintiff,

10 v.

11 THE DENTISTS INSURANCE COMPANY,

12 Defendant.

NO. 2:20-CV-0661-BJR

14
15 **STIPULATION**

16 **Whereas,**

17 1. From April through November of 2020, the plaintiffs in the above-captioned cases
18 filed original complaints for business interruption insurance coverage in this district. Certain of
19 these actions were stayed for periods of time pending review of the actions by the Judicial Panel
20 on Multidistrict Litigation (JPML) for potential consolidation and transfer.

21 2. After the JPML denied consolidation, the Court by order dated November 10,
22 2020, consolidated cases in this district by insurer family, and stayed discovery in each of the
23 consolidated cases until such time as the Court rules on dispositive motions.

25
26 STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS
CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-
BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR;
2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 3

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200
Seattle, WA 98101-3052
TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900
FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

3. On November 24, 2020, the Court granted the parties' Stipulated Motions for Amended Complaints and Briefing of Dispositive Motions and ordered amended complaints in the consolidated actions be filed no later than November 25, and that the briefing of dispositive motions in each of the consolidated cases be completed by March 5, 2021.

4. Under Local Rule 23(i)(3), there is a deadline to file a motion for class certification within 180 days of filing a complaint.

Now, therefore, in light of the Court’s orders, including the current discovery stay until the Court rules on dispositive motions, counsel for the parties agree that good cause exists to continue the date upon which the Plaintiffs shall file their motions for class certification pursuant to Local Civil Rule 23(i)(3).

The parties stipulate and request that a comprehensive case schedule, including deadlines for fact and expert discovery and (for class action cases) the filing of a motion for class certification, be set by the Court, if necessary, after the Court rules on the dispositive motions.

ORDER

Having reviewed the parties' stipulation, and finding that good cause exists for the requested relief from LCR 23(i)(3), the Court will, if necessary, issue a case schedule setting deadlines for fact and expert discovery and for Plaintiffs (in the class action cases) to file their motions for class certification in the above-referenced actions after the Court rules on the dispositive motions, which are scheduled to be fully briefed and filed no later than March 5, 2021, pursuant to the Court's November 24, 2020 Scheduling Order entered in the actions.

DATED this 7th day of January, 2021.

STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR; 2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 4

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200
Seattle, WA 98101-3052
TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900
FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26



Barbara J. Rothstein
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Presented By:

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

By: s/ Amy Williams-Derry

By: s/ Lynn L. Sarko

By: s/ Gretchen Freeman Cappio

By: s/ Ian S. Birk

By: s/ Irene M. Hecht

By: s/ Karin B. Swope

By: s/ Nathan L. Nanfelt

Amy Williams-Derry, WSBA #28711

Lynn Lincoln Sarko, WSBA #16569

Gretchen Freeman Cappio, WSBA #29576

Ian S. Birk, WSBA #31431

Irene M. Hecht, WSBA #11063

Karin B. Swope, WSBA #24015

Nathan Nanfelt, WSBA #45273

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200

Seattle, WA 98101

Telephone: (206) 623-1900

Fax: (206) 623-3384

Email: awilliams-derry@kellerrohrback.com

Email: lsarko@kellerrohrback.com

Email: gcappio@kellerrohrback.com

Email: ibirk@kellerrohrback.com

Email: ihecht@kellerrohrback.com

Email: kswope@kellerrohrback.com

Email: mfalecki@kellerrohrback.com

Email: nnanfelt@kellerrohrback.com

By: s/ Alison Chase

Alison Chase, *pro hac vice forthcoming*

801 Garden Street, Suite 301

Santa Barbara, CA 93101

Telephone: (805) 456-1496

Fax: (805) 456-1497

Email: achase@kellerrohrback.com

STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS
CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-
BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR;
2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 5

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200

Seattle, WA 98101-3052

TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900

FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

1 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs Nguyen et al., Pacific*
2 *Endodontics, et al., Chorak et al., Marler et al.,*
3 *McCulloch, et al., Caballero, Germack, La*
4 *Cocina de Oaxaca LLC, Owens Davies, P.S., and*
5 *The Seattle Symphony Orchestra*

6
7
8
9
10 **RUIZ & SMART**
11 **PLAINTIFF LITIGATION PLLC**

12 By: s/ William C. Smart

13 By: s/ Isaac Ruiz

14 By: s/ Kathrn Knudsen

15 William C. Smart, WSBA #8192

16 Isaac Ruiz, WSBA #35237

17 Kathryn M. Knudsen, WSBA #41075

18 Email: wsmart@plaintifflit.com

19 Email: iruiz@plaintifflit.com

20 Email: kknudsen@plaintifflit.com

21 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs Jennifer Strelow,*
22 *DMD and Shokofeh Tabaraie DDS PLLC*

23 **HACKETT, BEECHER & HART**

24 By: s/ Brent W. Beecher

25 Brent W. Beecher, WSBA #31095

26 601 Union Street, Suite 2600

Seattle, WA 98101

Telephone: (206) 787-1830

Email: bbeecher@hackettbeecher.com

27 *Attorneys for Seattle Bakery, LLC, CSQBKR2018,*
28 *LLC, Piroshky Piroshky Baker, LLC,*
29 *Piroshky Baking Company, LLC,*
30 *SCRBKR2017, LLC*

31 **THE LOYD LAW FIRM, P.L.L.C.**

32 By: s/ Shannon Loyd

33 Shannon Loyd

34 12703 Spectrum Drive, Suite 201

35 San Antonio, Texas 78249

36 Telephone: (210) 775-1424

37 Facsimile: (210) 775-1410

38 Email: shannon@theloydlawfirm.com

39 *Attorneys for Plaintiff J Bells LLC*

40 STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS
41 CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-
42 BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR;
43 2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 6

44 **KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.**

45 1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200

46 Seattle, WA 98101-3052

47 TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900

48 FAXSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

GORDON TILDEN THOMAS & CORDEL LLP

By: s/ Mark A. Wilner

Mark A. Wilner, WSBA #31550
One Union Square
600 University Street, Suite 2915
Seattle, WA 98101
Telephone: (206) 467-6477
Fax: (206) 467-6292
Email: <mailto:fcordell@gordontilden.com>
mwilner@gordontilden.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Suneet Bath,
Noskenda Inc.*

GORDON TILDEN THOMAS & CORDEL LLP

By: s/ Franklin D. Cordell

By: s/ Kasey D. Huebner

Franklin D. Cordell, WSBA #26392
Kasey D. Huebner, WSBA #32890
One Union Square
600 University Street, Suite 2915
Seattle, WA 98101
Telephone: (206) 467-6477
Fax: (206) 467-6292
Email: fcordell@gordontilden.com
Email: khuebner@gordontilden.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff The Seattle Symphony Orchestra

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP

By: s/ Robin E. Wechkin

Robin E. Wechkin, WSBA No. 24746
1420 Fifth Avenue, Suite 1400
Seattle, WA 98101
Telephone: (415) 439-1799
Email: rwechkin@sidley.com

Yvette Ostolaza (pro hac vice)
Yolanda C. Garcia (pro hac vice)
2021 McKinney Avenue, Suite 2000
Dallas, Texas 75201

STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR; 2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 7

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200
Seattle, WA 98101-3052
TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900
FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

1 Telephone: (214) 981-3401
2 Facsimile: (214) 981-3400
3 Email: yvette.ostolaza@sidley.com
4 Email: ygarcia@sidley.com

5
6 *Attorneys for Defendant Aspen American
7 Insurance Company*

8 **DLA PIPER LLP (US)**

9 By: s/ Anthony Todaro
10 By: s/ Lianna M. Bash
11 Anthony Todaro, WSBA No. 30391 Lianna
12 Bash, WSBA No. 52598
13 701 Fifth Avenue, Suite 6900
14 Seattle, Washington 98104-7029
15 Tel: 206.839.4800
16 Fax: 206.839.4801
17 E-mail: anthony.todaro@us.dlapiper.com
18 E-mail: lianna.bash@us.dlapiper.com

19 **PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON &
20 GARRISON LLP**

21 By: s/ H. Christopher Boehning
22 By: s/ Elizabeth M. Sacksteder
23 By: s/ Daniel H. Levi
24 By: s/ Hallie S. Goldblatt
25 H. Christopher Boehning (pro hac vice)
26 Elizabeth M. Sacksteder (pro hac vice)
Daniel H. Levi (pro hac vice)
Hallie S. Goldblatt (pro hac vice)
1285 Avenue of the Americas
New York, New York 10019-6064
Tel: 212.373.3000
Fax: 212.757.3990
E-mail: cboehning@paulweiss.com
E-mail: esacksteder@paulweiss.com
E-mail: dlevi@paulweiss.com
E-mail: hgoldblatt@paulweiss.com

27 *Attorneys for Defendants Valley Forge Insurance
28 Company and Transportation Insurance Company
29 FORSBERG & UMLAUF, P.S.*

30 By: s/ Matthew S. Adams
31 Matthew S. Adams
32 901 Fifth Avenue, Suite 1400
33 Seattle, WA 98164

34 STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS
35 CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-
36 BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR;
37 2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 8

38 **KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.**

39 1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200
40 Seattle, WA 98101-3052
41 TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900
42 FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

1 Telephone: 206-689-8500
2 Fax: 206-689-8501
Email: madams@foum.law

3 **STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP**

4 Sarah D. Gordon (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)
1330 Connecticut Avenue, NW
5 Telephone: (202) 429-3000
Facsimile: (202) 429-3902
6 Email: sgordon@steptoe.com

7 Anthony J. Anscombe (*pro hac vice*
forthcoming)
8 One Market Plaza
9 Spear Tower, Suite 3900
San Francisco, CA 94105
Telephone: (415) 365-6700
Facsimile: (312) 577-1370
10 Email: aanscombe@steptoe.com

11 *Attorneys for Defendants Sentinel Insurance
12 Company, Ltd. and Hartford Casualty Insurance
13 Company*

14 **BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP**

15 By: s/ James R. Morrison
16 James R. Morrison, WSBA No. 43043
999 Third Avenue, Suite 3900
17 Seattle, WA 98104-4040
Phone: (206) 332-1380
E-mail: jmorison@bakerlaw.com

18 **ALSTON & BIRD LLP**

19 By: s/ Cari K. Dawson
20 Cari K. Dawson (*pro hac vice*) Kara
F. Kennedy (*pro hac vice*)
21 1201 W. Peachtree St.
Atlanta, GA 30309
22 Phone: (404) 881-7000
Email: cari.dawson@alston.com
Email: kara.kennedy@alston.com

23 *Attorneys for Defendants American Fire and
24 Casualty Company, The Ohio Casualty Insurance
25 Company, and Ohio Security Insurance Company*

26 STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS
CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-
BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR;
2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 9

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200
Seattle, WA 98101-3052
TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900
FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

BULLIVANT Houser Bailey, PC

By: s/ John D. Bennett

John A. Bennett, WSBA #33214
Stuart D. Jones (pro hac vice)
925 Fourth Avenue, Ste. 3800
Seattle, Washington 98104
Telephone: (206) 292-8930
E-mail: john.bennett@bullivant.com
E-mail: stuart.jones@bullivant.com

WIGGIN AND DANA LLP

By: s/ Michael Menapace

Michael Menapace (pro hac vice)
Robyn Gallagher (pro hac vice)
20 Church Street
Hartford, Connecticut 06103
Tel.: (860) 297-3700
E-mail: mmenapace@wiggin.com
E-mail: rgallagher@wiggin.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Massachusetts Bay
Insurance Company*

By: s/ Daniel R. Bentson

By: s/ Owen R. Mooney

Daniel R. Bentson, WSBA #36825 Owen
R. Mooney, WSBA #45779
925 Fourth Avenue, Ste. 3800
Seattle, Washington 98104
Telephone: (206) 292-8930
E-mail: dan.bentson@bullivant.com
E-mail: owen.mooney@bullivant.com

ROBINSON & COLE LLP

By: *s/ Wystan M. Ackerman*

Wystan M. Ackerman (pro hac vice)
Stephen E. Goldman (pro hac vice)
280 Trumbull Street
Hartford, CT 06103
Telephone: (860) 275-8388
Email: wackerman@rc.com
Email: sgoldman@rc.com

STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR; 2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 10

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200
Seattle, WA 98101-3052
TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900
FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384

*Attorneys for Defendants Travelers Casualty
Insurance Company of America, The Travelers
Indemnity Co. of America, and The Charter Oak
Fire Insurance Company*

BULLIVANT Houser Bailey, PC

By: s/ John A. Bennett

John A. Bennett, WSBA #33214

Stuart D. Jones (pro hac vice)

925 Fourth Avenue, Ste. 380

Seattle, Washington 98104

Telephone: (206) 292-8930

E-mail: john.bennett@bullivant.com

E-mail: stuart.jones@bullivant.com

STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP

By: s/ Antonia B. Ianniello

Antonia B. Ianniello (pro hac vice)

1330 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20036

Telephone: (202) 429-8087
Fax: (202) 429-3803

Facsimile: (202) 429-3902

By: s/ *Darlene K. Alt*

Darlene K. Alt (pro hac vice)

227 West Monroe Street, Ste.

4700 Chicago, Illinois 60606

Telephone: (312) 577-1262

*Attorneys for Defendant Tri-State Insurance
Company of Minnesota*

1833-1011-8358 v. 1

STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION (Case Nos. 2:20-cv-00616-BJR; 2:20-cv-00809-BJR; 2:20-cv-05437-BJR; 2:20-cv-00627-BJR; 2:20-cv-00620-BJR; 2:20-cv-00597-BJR; 2:20-cv-01176-BJR; 2:20-cv-0661-BJR) - 11

KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.

1201 Third Avenue Suite 3200

201 Third Avenue, Suite 32
Seattle, WA 98101-3052

TELEPHONE: (206) 623-1900

FACSIMILE: (206) 623-3384